# Sweet as? She'll be right? What's happening with Smokefree Aotearoa?

23 September2020

Richard Edwards, ASPIRE 2025 and Dept of Public Health University of Otago, Wellington



## Things New Zealand is known for



#### Asia & Pacific

it.

### New Zealand isn't just flattening the curve. It's squashing

New confirmed cases of Covid-19 in United States, United Kingdom and New Zealand

Seven-day rolling average of new cases (per million)



Source: Financial Times analysis of data from the European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control, the Covid Tracking Project, the UK Dept of Health & Social Care and the Spanish Ministry of Health. Data updated September 20 2020 6.01pm BST. Interactive version: ft.com/covid19

#### **FINANCIAL TIMES**

### #NZHellhole

An offshore Twitter account, with 7500 followers, likened Aotearoa to hell on Earth, saying on Sunday: "You can't leave. And you can't easily have people in. And you're back in lockdown in major parts of the country. And the quarantine camps are public knowledge."



Lamentations **UUU** @TeEvaLament · Sep 20



Jo Rosey @JoRosey1 · Sep 12 It's clouding over. #nzhellhole



### #NZHellhole



Horatio Dandy @DandyHoratio

This man tried to swim to freedom from our island gulag. The authorities caught him and plunged him alive in molten bronze. His body is displayed as a warning to others. #NZHellhole



 $(\mathbf{i})$ 

12:28 AM · Aug 23, 2020



# Overview

- 1. Setting the scene 1: NZ smoking and smokefree context
- 2. Setting the scene 2: Research interests
- 3. So what? NZ experience and TCRG

## **Milestones in NZ tobacco control**

- 1963 TV & radio advertising banned
- 1974 First health warnings
- 1985 First substantial tax increases
- 1990 Most indoor workplaces smokefree,<16 years sales banned, advertising banned</li>
- 1995 Tobacco sponsorship ended
- 1995 Quitline launched
- 1999 First subsidised NRT
- 2004 Bars & restaurants smokefree
- 2008 Pictorial health warnings





SMOKING IS HIGHLY



# Māori Affairs Select Committee, 2010 "We recommend

L10A

NZ SANTAT

Inquiry into the tobacco industry in Aotearoa and the consequences of tobacco use for Māori

Report of the Maori Affairs Committee

Forty-ninth Parliament (Hon Tau Henare, Chairperson) November 2010

Presented to the House of Representatives

"We recommend to the Government that it aim for tobacco consumption and smoking prevalence to be halved by 2015 across all demographics, followed by a longerterm goal of making New Zealand a smokefree nation by 2025."

### Government response to Māori Affairs Select Committee report, 2011

"The Committee's report is clear that "the term 'smoke-free' is intended to communicate an **aspirational goal** and not a commitment to the banning of smoking altogether by 2025" (p.10). On that basis, the Government agrees with a longer term goal of reducing smoking prevalence and tobacco availability to minimal levels, thereby making New Zealand essentially a smoke-free nation by

**2025** "Government Response to the Report of the Māori Affairs Committee on its *Inquiry into the tobacco industry in Aotearoa and the consequences of tobacco use for Māori NZ Government, 2011.* 

# NZ Tobacco Control landmarks



### Māori leadership and engagement with Smokefree Aotearoa 2025

It emerged out of new thinking on tobacco control by Māori leaders appalled by the unnecessary and wholly preventable loss of life and illness that afflicted Māori due to tobacco smoking.

1104



Inquiry into the tobacco industry in Aotearoa and the consequences of tobacco use for Māori

Report of the Māori Affairs Committee

Forty-ninth Parliament (Hon Tau Henare, Chairperson) November 2010

Presented to the House of Representatives

#### Harawira Declares War On Big Tobacco

Wednesday, 31 May 2006, 12:04 am Article: Kevin List

Scoop Audio: Harawira Declares War On Big Tobacco





in New Zealand



🐐 News & Events Resource Hub Get Involved Our Work About U

# Treaty of Waitangi

- Signed in 1840 by chiefs representing most Māori lwi (tribes)
- Founding document of NZ and provided constitutional basis for British law and government (the Crown)
   Treaty principles:
  - partnership between Māori and the crown
  - participation of Māori in governance
  - protection for Māori and their taonga and land



THE SIGNING OF THE TREATY OF WAITANGI, FEBRUARY 6, 1840.
The day that have Zealand became a pair of the Britsh Engine. The paining displays the historical gravia suscellated at the residence of Mr. James Budy, Britsh Resident, at Waitang, Bay of Islands, to neet Ception-Watern Holson, R.N., first Gourney of Neet Zealand. The Rev. Henry Wittames and as a strategies, readining the terms of the Tarty is the Main class.

Picture source: Archives New Zealand, https://www.flickr.com/photos/archivesnz/16044258961







# Trends in adult daily smoking (NZHS)



2025

# 2. Ongoing uptake among youth and young adults

Regular smoking prevalence in young adults (2013 Census)



# Tobacco and vaping industry in New Zealand

- Smoked tobacco market dominated by three companies
- Pre-March 2018, vaping production and sales dominated by local companies
- HTPs available since March 2018 (IQOS, Glo)
- Dynamic vaping market, including pod devices

# Tobacco and vaping industry in New Zealand

The top three manufacturers account for over 95% of legally purchased tobacco consumed in New Zealand

#### 2.2.2 New Zealand legal tobacco competitive overview

Figure 2.2.2a: Market share by manufacturer, 2018<sup>(1)</sup>







Total market: 0.44 million kilograms

KPMG Illicit tobacco in New Zealand, 2019., <u>https://www.stopillegal.com/docs/default-source/external-docs/kpmg-illicit-tobacco-in-new-zealand-2018-full-year-report-(may-2019).pdf</u>



- 1. Setting the scene 1: NZ smoking and smokefree context
- 2. Setting the scene 2: Research interests
- 3. So what? NZ experience and TCRG

## Tobacco control policy research

Policy: justification, feasibility, acceptability, impact etc

## Examples

- Smokefree policies
- PoS displays and display bans
- Standardised packaging
- Tobacco taxation

## Endgame research

- Endgame concept
- Achieving the tobacco/smoking endgame
- Experiences and progress towards the endgame
- Smokefree Aotearoa

# **Endgame thinking**

- Ongoing and unacceptable tobacco-related pandemic Growth in 'Endgame' ideas, features:
  - reject status quo & incrementalism -> overarching radical goal
  - reject business-as-usual -> game changer interventions



## 'Imagine things otherwise'



# Ending appreciable tobacco use in a nation: using a sinking lid on supply

George Thomson, Nick Wilson, Tony Blakely, Richard Edv

### Awareness and support for New Zealand's Smokefree 2025 goal and key measures to achieve it

INTERNATIONAL TOBACCO CONTROL (ITC) NEW ZEALAND AND ITC CROSS-COUNTRY FINDINGS JUNE 2020

# Young smoker responses to Smokefree 2025 goal

*"This is awesome...This makes me feel really proud to be a New Zealander"* 

*"I reckon it's pretty cool. I don't want to be a smoker in fifteen years."* 

"I'll be really pissed off when they it smokefree and I can't buy cigarettes any more. At least for the first two weeks ... but in the long run, I think smoking is something our country can do without." ".. it would be something that would be amazing, but I don't know how possible it would be."

"2025 ....[pause] am I allowed to swear? [laughs] in your fucking dreams."

Maubach et al. Tobacco Control 2013; 22: 395-400

# Nature of endgame goals



Minimal smoking prevalence and tobacco availability by 2025



< 5% smoking prevalence by 2025



< 5% smoking prevalence <u>and</u> nicotine use by 2030



≤ 5% smoking prevalence by 2034



< 5% smoking prevalence by 2035

Smokefree Aotearoa: need for more policy advances and greater political priority/po will



- No strategy/action plan
- Lack of action to address key MASC recommendations:
  - Reducing supply/availability of tobacco products
  - Product modification (e.g. additives, nicotine levels, filters)
- No increase in mass media etc resources (despite tax revenues)
- 2017 Govt disappointing:
  - Lack of new policy initiatives other than SF cars and ecigarette legislation
  - Tobacco tax increases end after 2020

### A comprehensive action plan for Smokefree Aotearoa?

#### GOVT COMMITS TO PLAN

At Tuesday's event, Associate Health Minister Jenny Salesa committed to developing an action plan to achieve the target. "We want to build on the achievements of tobacco control and I am committed to developing a plan," she said.



ROSA WOODS/STUFF

Associate Health Minister Jenny Salesa has committed to developing a plan for achieving a smokefree New Zealand by 2025.

#### Stuff report March 27 2018

https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/102608415/no-room-for-complacency-if-were-to-reach-kick-smoking-by-2025-helen-clark-says

## How can we get to a Smokefree Aotearoa?

- Make smoked tobacco products:
- Less affordable
- Less available
- Less addictive and less appealing/palatable

Intensify what we currently do

Greater availability of alternatives to smoked tobacco products



https://aspire2025.org.nz/hot-topics/smokefree-action-plan/

### Overview

- 1. Setting the scene 1: NZ smoking and smokefree context
- 2. Setting the scene 2: Research interests
- 3. So what? NZ experience and TCRG
  - Developments in tobacco and vaping industries/markets/behaviours
  - E-cigarettes debates, policy and impacts

# New Zealand vaping products regulatory context

### Pre 2017

- ECs prohibited for sale but could be bought online and imported for personal use
- Specialist vape stores sell non-nicotine containing ECs and e-liquids
- Vaping products imported or locally sourced

### March 2017

- National Government announced intent to relax policy
  - retail availability of ECs progressively increased
  - vape shops not prosecuted for selling ECs

### March 2018 Court ruling (MoH vs PMI)

- Legal to sell ECs (inc HTPs but not oral tobacco products)
- No effective regulation from this date
  - progressive increase in availability: sales from convenience stores, supermarkets and gas stations
  - increasing marketing of ECs (including TV)
  - no regulation of product standards, flavours, packaging, nicotine content etc
- Tobacco industry enters the market, included HTPs (IQOS)
- Calls for regulation (all sides) + debate about form it should take

### August 2020 – Vaping legislation passed

Comprehensive regulatory framework



Home News Radio Podcasts & Series Topics Pacific

New Zealand World Politics Pacific Te Ao Māori Sport Business Country

#### NEW ZEALAND / HEALTH

# Vaping ads rocket ahead of proposed regulation

9:13 am on 28 August 2019



Matthew Theunissen, Reporter matthew.theunissen@rnz.co.nz







### Tobacco industry comes into the open





# Why 'big Tobacco' Sells Vapes In NZ

Wednesday, 13 May 2020, 7:44 am Opinion: Dr Grant O Connell

> https://www.scoop.co.nz/stories/BU2005/S002 65/why-big-tobacco-sells-vapes-in-nz.htm

# PMI in New Zealand

FSFW Research Centre
'Outreach' activities
End cigarette sales???

. . . .

### Centre of Research Excellence: Indigenous Sovereignty & Smoking

#### **KAUPAPA / OUR PURPOSE**

Our mission is to support indigenous aspirations to flourish as individuals, families, tribes and nations who are recognized as sovereign people. We will deliver on our mission by:

- Building indigenous peoples' capacity to respond to, and reduce, the harms caused by tobacco smoking.
- Advance knowledge on indigenous tobacco use and how to more rapidly reduce the number of people using tobacco in a harmful way.
- Advance knowledge on the theory of addiction, behaviour change and harm reduction by adding an indigenous perspective.



### Do We *Really* Need Another Law?

The cost to New Zealand of banning smoking in cars.

MAREWA GLOVER, PhD

#### IN DEPTH / HEALTH

# Philip Morris tried to target poor through poverty group and Counties Manukau DHB

7:31 am on 27 August 2019



Guyon Espiner, Investigative reporter, In Depth @GuyonEspiner guyon.espiner@rnz.co.nz

Tobacco giant Philip Morris has been trying to gain access to a major Auckland poverty group in a bid to get its new tobacco products marketed to poor people.

The tobacco company has also been lobbying key figures in the Ministry of Health and approached South Auckland's Counties Manukau District Health Board (DHB) in an attempt to give away its IQOS "smokeless tobacco" device, which it says is less harmful than cigarettes, for use in quit smoking groups.

<u>https://www.rnz.co.nz/news/in-depth/397544/philip-morris-tried-to-target-poor-through-poverty-group-and-counties-manukau-dhb</u>

Share this

 $\sim$ 

#### IN DEPTH / HEALTH

# Big Tobacco targeting Māori with e-cigarettes

5:14 pm on 11 July 2019



Tobacco company Philip Morris is visiting marae and sports clubs to offer free trials and discounts on its ecigarette as it targets Māori. In the first story in the *Smoke and Mirrors* series, Guyon Espiner asks if vaping and e-cigarettes offer smokers a less dangerous habit or give them a new, damaging problem.

> https://www.rnz.co.nz/news/in-depth/394073/bigtobacco-targeting-maori-with-e-cigarettes


AUGUST 14, 2019





A MODEL WALKS THE RUNWAY AT A SHOW DURING NEW ZEALAND FASHION WEEK 2018. (PHOTO: STEFAN GOSATTI/GETTY IMAGES)

## NZ Fashion Week's secret plan to bring big tobacco to the catwalk



Maria Slade | Guest writer

https://thespinoff.co.nz/business/14-08-2019/the-tobaccoindustrys-secret-plan-to-rejoin-nz-fashion-week/



### Tobacco giant Philip Morris will stop selling cigarettes in NZ tax break or not

MAR 12, 2019 . SOURCE: 1 NEWS

Tobacco company Philip Morris says it will stop the sale of cigarettes in New Zealand when required to by law, regardless of whether the government lowers taxes on its new smokeless tobacco products.

Asked why his company doesn't simply remove cigarettes from the shelves right now, if they are not seeking a tax break, Mr Williams said "it's a very complex issue".

https://www.tvnz.co.nz/one-news/new-zealand/tobacco-giant-philip-morris-stop-selling-cigarettes-in-nz-tax-breaknot?variant=tb v 1

# Can the tobacco industry transform, and if so what would it look like?

- Scepticism!!!
- Tobacco Transformation Index
- Possible criteria for a transformed industry
  - Tobacco free vision with a clear timeline
  - Rapid progress reduction in sales
  - Promote and support stronger regulation of smoked tobacco products
  - •
  - Evidence of diversification into other products such as NGPs



# Possible positive and negative impacts for vaping in reaching Smokefree Aotearoa

#### Direct positive impacts

- Enhanced quitting smoking among smokers
- Reduced smoking uptake among youth (displacement)

#### Null effect

Smokers quit with ECs instead of through other means

#### Direct negative impacts

- Reduced smoking cessation
- Health impacts among nonsmokers who use ECs
- Gateway effects to smoking

Indirect positive impacts

- Synergistic impact of interventions
- Facilitate implementation of smoked tobacco control measures
- Disrupt (positively) the smoked tobacco market

### Indirect negative impacts

 Distraction from advocating for and implementing other effective measures
 Undermining of other effective measures (fostering disunity of smokefree sector)

## E-cigarettes as disruptive technology

Smoking prevalence and tobacco consumption

In terms of the historical use of tobacco and the disease burden from smoking, the rise of the electronic cigarette seems to be a game changer with potentially huge implications for consumers, public health and industry.

> Stimson G et al. Disruptive innovations: The rise of the electronic cigarette. International Journal of Drug Policy 25 (2014) 653–655

> > nicotine

#### Potential Country-level Health and Cost Impacts of Legalizing Domestic Sale of Vaporized Nicotine Products

Frederieke S. Petrović-van der Deen,<sup>a</sup> Nick Wilson,<sup>a</sup> Anna Crothers,<sup>b</sup> Christine L. Cleghorn,<sup>a</sup> Coral Gartner,<sup>c</sup> and Tony Blakely<sup>a,d</sup>

- Substantial potential health benefits and health system cost savings from liberalized sales of ECs
- Sensitive to assumptions about:
  - Impact of ECs on population cessation rates
  - Relative health effects of ECs (cf smoking)
  - Impact of ECs on smoking initiation among youth

Lifetime health gains and health system cost savings for 2011 NZ population (base scenario vs BAU, 0% discounting

> Remaining Lifetime (with 95% UIs)

Age Group (at Baseline)	QALYs Gained	Net Cost Savings (NZ\$ million for Year 2011)
0–14 years	68,100 (-23,900 to 188,000)	\$1,010 (-\$530 to \$2,930)
15-24 years	59,100 (13,000 to 117,000)	\$930 (\$218 to \$1,910)
25-44 years	72,000 (13,200 to 126,000)	\$1,070 (\$257 to \$1,910)
45-64 years	35,000 (-1,200 to 61,200)	\$400 (\$11 to \$712)
65+ years	1,690 (-4,020 to 3,950)	\$11 (-\$24 to \$26)
All age groups combined	236,000 (27,000 to 457,000)	\$3,420 (\$370 to \$7,050) <sup>d</sup>

# Smoking and use of ECs for quitting in England (Smoking Toolkit Study)



# Trends in current smoking and vaping (NZHS)





Percentage of smokers and recent ex-smokers who said they currently use an e-cigarette daily/at least once a week/at least once a month, by country





After 13 years of smoking Clinton Evans made the switch, "My main reason for vaping wasn't mainly cause of my health especially cause of my age, it was mainly because of the price of cigarettes. The price of where every six months they were going up and up and basically I just couldn't afford the habit that I created."





"The positive impacts of e-cigarettes are likely to be much greater if e-cigarettes are more affordable, more available, and more appealing, *relative to* smoked tobacco products."



Smoked tobacco products	E-cigarettes
Less affordable	More affordable
Less available	More available
Less appealing	More appealing

Public Health Expert Blog, October 2017 https://blogs.otago.ac.nz/pubhealthexpert/2017/10/06/ achieving-smokefreeaotearoa-by-2025-a-response-to-critiques

"Combining a mandated VLNC cigarette policy with other interventions, particularly expanding access to alternative nicotine-delivery products such as e-cigarettes, is likely to enhance the effectiveness of each of these measures, and to make a mandated VLNC policy more acceptable by ensuring alternative nicotine-delivery products are available for those who can't, or don't want to, quit nicotine use." – ASAP Report





### NZ-ITC, <u>Smoker</u> and Recent Quitter Support for key ASAP measures



## Underming the tobacco control sector

## Philip Morris's Project Sunrise: weakening tobacco control by working with it

P A McDaniel, E A Smith, R E Malone

Tobacco Control 2006;15:215-223. doi: 10.1136/tc.2005.014977

#### • PMI's 'divide and rule' strategy as laid out in internal documents

A corporate affairs document explained that tobacco control organisations drew their strength from "their funding, their credibility in public opinion, and … their unity. Our primary strategies focus on impacting each of [these] sources of strength".

> "....[t]he rapid growth in resources, membership and successes has created a sense of invincibility within the ATI that may blind organizations to carefully orchestrated efforts by the tobacco industry and its allies to accelerate turf wars and exacerbate philosophical schisms (smoking and ETS, vs. youth and marketing)."

# PMI 10 year strategy

10 year Corporate Affairs Objectives and Strategies

This document outlines key objectives, strategies and actions for the PMI CA organization over the next 10 years, in support of our combustible and reduced risk (RRP) product businesses.

- No 1 objective 'normalization' of PMI 'position at the table' (especially for RRP regulation)
- Oppose 'extreme regulation' vs smoked tobacco products e.g.
  - Tax increases above inflation, industry profit taxes, earmarking
  - Plain packs, PoS display bans, packaging format restrictions, GHWs>65%
  - Nicotine limits, ingredients bans, menthol bans, design restrictions (capsule, slims etc)
  - 'Extreme' retailer licensing, duty free ban or restrictions, >18 years age limits
  - Outdoor smokefree laws and smokefree cars
- Marginalise the policies and advocates of extreme measures as 'prohibitionists'
- Amplify voices of 'harm reduction' supporters vs 'prohibitionists'

#### Marewa Glover & David Sweanor: Vaping can make us smoke-free by 2025

3 Aug, 2017 5:00am

() 5 minutes to read



Vapers avoid the deadly inhalation of smoke that kills people addicted to cigarettes. Photo / 123RF

NZ Herald



By Marewa Glover & David Sweanor

AUGUST 4, 2017



A CLOSE-UP VIEW OF CIGARETTES ON JUNE 10, 2015. (PHOTO BY MATT CARDY/GETTY IMAGES)

### How to stop smoking (hint: it's not making cigarettes more expensive)



Marewa Glover and David Sweanor | Guest writers

New Zealand already has some of the highest tobacco taxes in the world, and now some campaigners are calling for them to raised much further. But how effective would that be? Not very, say tobacco-control experts Marewa Glover and David Sweanor. What's needed are solutions that empower smokers, not punish them further. A Surge Strategy for Smokefree Aotearoa 2025 The role and regulation of vaping and other low-risk smokefree nicotine products

> Clive D. Bates Professor Robert Beaglehole Dr George Laking David Sweanor Ben Youdan

> > October 2019

#### **VAPING**: degrees of harm

E-cigarette and smokeless tobacco products A NARRATIVE REVIEW OF EVIDENCE

<image>







#### Richard Edwards @ProfEdwardsNZ · 14 Nov 2017

#### Replying to @VapingAlliance

1 1

Sigh. Strange maybe, but also untrue. What I said whilst talking to this slide was that it was unfortunate that the debate was so heated/vicious on both sides. The bullet points were examples of unhelpful statements/attitudes that I gave to illustrate the point.

1II



```
NZ Vaping Alliance @VapingAlliance \cdot 14 Nov 2017
Fair enough. Thanks for taking the time to clarify this.
```



**Richard Edwards** @ProfEdwardsNZ · 14 Nov 2017 Thanks for acknowledgement.





#### Richard Edwards @ProfEdwardsNZ · 14 Nov 2017

Just sent response making it clear that I said no such thing. Our ASAP strategy supports making e-cigs more widely available, but also argues for complementary measures and debate about appropriate policy/regulation to maximise positive effects. See: blogs.otago.ac.nz/pubhealthexper...



#### WellingtonVapers @WellingtonVaper · 14 Nov 2017

Yes I've already read it, as well as fully supportive of the ASAP initiatives... which is why I found that particular comment completely out of character in your defence.



#### DrMA @mihotep · 13 Nov 2017

Replying to @VapingAlliance @ProfEdwardsNZ

Not strange at all, really. The **#quack** calling himself "Prof" Edwards is basically the Southern hemisphere's glANTZ. There's no low he wouldn't stoop to in the relentless pursuit of **#KeepSmokingWeNeedTheMoney** 

## Possible research questions

- What are the impacts of the indirect effects of e-cigarettes (positive and negative)?
- What is the balance between the positive and negative indirect impacts?
- How strong are the synergy effects (impact, policy facilitation) between smoked tobacco product regulation and e-cigarette regulation?
- To what degree do these impacts vary by context?
  - LMICs vs HICs

. . . . . . . . . . . .

- Strength of smoked tobacco policy implementation
- Local culture and norms (population, smokefree sector etc)
- Influence and behaviour of the tobacco and vaping industry and advocacy groups

## Conclusions

We live in interesting times!Questions or comments?





A Smokefree Aotearoa by 2025

—let's do it for the kids





# Kia ora Thank you

richard.edwards@otago.ac.nz

www.aspire2025.org.nz

@ASPIRE2025 @profedwardsnz